Marc I. Kunkin (MIK4182)
SCHINDEL, FARMAN, LIPSIUS
GARNDER & RABINOVICH LLP
14 Penn Plaza, Suite 500
New York, NY 10122
(212) 563-1710
Attorneys for Defendants, AZ Container Freight Station, Inc.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

THE HARTFORD FINANCIAL SERVICES: GROUP, as subrogee of DM FRAGRANCES AND: COSMETICS,

Civil Action No.: 07 CIV 8775 (Judge Castel)

Plaintiffs,

-against-

ANSWER TO C&G'S CROSS-CLAIM

C & G DELIVERY, INC., UNITED SHIPPING, : INC. and AZ CONTAINER FREIGHT STATION : INC.,

Defendants.

Defendant AZ CONTAINER FREIGHT STATION, INC., ("AZ"), by its attorneys Schindel, Farman, Lipsius, Gardner & Rabinovich, LLP, answering cross claim of C&G

Delivery, Inc. ("C&G"), upon information and belief, states as follows:

## CROSS CLAIM AGAINST UNITED SHIPPING INC. AND AZ CONTAINER FREIGHT STATIONS, INC.

- 1. Denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph 35 of the cross claim.
- 2. Denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph 36 of the cross claim.

SECOND CROSS CLAIM AGAINST UNITED SHIPPING INC. AND AZ CONTAINER FREIGHT STATIONS, INC.

- 3. Denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph 37 of the cross claim.
- 4. Denies each and every allegation contained in paragraph 38 of the cross claim.

#### **GENERAL PROVISION**

1. Any and all allegations not specifically admitted herein are denied.

## **AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES**

## FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

2. C&G has failed to state a cause of action against AZ.

## SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

3. The Property that is the subject matter of plaintiff's complaint and C&G's cross claims was accepted by AZ in accordance with, and subject to all the terms and conditions of all applicable contracts of carriage, contracts for storage, forwarding agreements, waybills, warehouse receipts, invoices, bills of lading, any applicable tariffs and classifications, and the rules set forth therein. AZ duly performed the terms and conditions on its part to be performed. AZ claims the benefit of all defenses accorded it by those contracts of carriage, contracts for storage, forwarding agreements, waybills, warehouse receipts, invoices, bills of lading, any applicable tariffs and classifications, and the rules set forth therein and any other applicable contracts under which the Cargo was transported, stored and/or handled.

## THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

4. The liability of AZ, if any, is limited by the terms and conditions of any applicable contracts of carriage, contracts of storage, forwarding agreements, warehouse receipts, invoices, bills of lading, any applicable tariffs and classifications, and the rules set forth therein, statutes and/or regulation.

## FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

5. The claims against AZ is untimely pursuant to the applicable contract(s) and/or tariff(s) and/or statute(s).

## <u>FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE</u>

The loss and/or damage to the Cargo was caused by the intervening acts of 6. plaintiff, C&G, and/or third person(s) which could not be prevented by AZ through the exercise of reasonable care.

## SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

7. This Court lacks jurisdiction over the person of AZ.

## SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

To the extent that plaintiff and/or C&G seek recovery for special damages, AZ 8. is not responsible.

## EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

In the event that the plaintiff had not or has not any title or interest in the 9. property that is the subject of this action, then the plaintiff is not the real party of interest herein and is not entitled to maintain this suit.

## NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Upon information and belief, plaintiff and/or C&G have failed to mitigate 10. damages.

## TENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

The loss at issue was caused by an act or default of the shipper or its agent. 11.

## ELEVENTH THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

Plaintiff and/ or C&G, has failed to properly serve AZ, its agents and/or 12. employees.

## TWELFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

13. AZ hereby reserves all of its rights to amend this answer and/or supplement its Affirmative Defenses in accordance with any additional information developed during the course of discovery.

WHEREFORE, defendant AZ Container Freight Station, Inc. demands judgment dismissing the cross claim together with costs, disbursement and such other and further relief as this Court deems just and proper.

Dated: January 30, 2008 New York, New York

> SCHINDEL, FARMAN, LIPSIUS, GARDNER & RABINOVICH, LLP Attorneys for Defendants, AZ Container Freight Station, Inc.

By:

Marc I. Kunkin (MK4182)

14 Penn Plaza, Suite 500

New York, New York 10122

(212) 563-1710

Our File: 4162.0008

TO: David Y. Loh, Esq.
COZEN O'CONNOR
45 Broadway Atrium, Suite 1600
New York, New York 10006
(212) 908-1202
Your File No.: 215882

Alfred J. Will, Esq. BADIAK & WILL, LLP 106 Third Street Mineola, NY 11501 (516) 877-2225 07-P-009-AK Case 1:07-cv-08775-PKC Document 18 Filed 01/30/2008 Page 5 of 6

John Sandercok, Esq. LESTER, SCHWAB KATZ & DWYER, LLP 120 Broadway, 38th Floor New York, NY 10271 212-341-4479

# Case 1:07-cv-08775-PKC Document 18 Filed 01/30/2008 Page 6 of 6 AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE

STATE OF NEW YORK	)
	) ss.
COUNTY OF NEW YORK	)

I, Latoya Peterson, being duly sworn, states as follows: I am over 18 years of age, not a party to the within action, and reside at 14 Penn Plaza, Suite 500, New York, New York 10122. On January 30, 2008, I served the within **Answer to C&G's Cross -Claim** upon the person(s) or parties designated below by mailing a true and complete copy of same in a postage pre-paid envelope, and depositing same in a post office or official depository of the United States Postal Service within New York State, at the last known address of the addressee(s) as set forth herein.

TO: Alfred J. Will, Esq.
BADIAK & WILL, LLP
106 Third Street
Mineola, NY 11501

David Y. Loh, Esq. COZEN O'CONNOR 45 Broadway Atrium, Suite 1600 New York, New York 10006

John Sandercok, Esq. LESTER, SCHWAB KATZ & DWYER, LLP 120 Broadway, 38th Floor New York, NY 10271

Latoya Peterson

Sworn to before me this 30<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2008

**Notary Public** 

LORIENTON N.A. PALMER Notary Public, State of New York No. 02PA4983745 Qualified in Nassau County Commission Expires July 8, 2011